

**Climate Change Commission Board Meeting (Meeting 8)**  
**Tuesday, 9 June 2020**

A meeting of the Climate Change Commission Board Members was held via Zoom Teleconference Facility. The meeting started at 10.00am and finished at 4.50pm.

**Climate Change Commission Attendees:**

Dr Rod Carr - Chairperson  
Lisa Tumahai - Deputy Chair  
Dr Harry Clark  
Dr Judy Lawrence  
Catherine Leining  
Professor James Renwick  
Professor Nicola Shadbolt

**Invited Attendees:**

Jo Hendy – Chief Executive  
[REDACTED] - Executive Assistant and Minute Taker

**Guests:**

[REDACTED] – Principal Analyst  
Astrid Nunns – Director, Strategy & Engagement  
[REDACTED] - Advisor  
[REDACTED] - Engagement and Communications Advisor  
[REDACTED] - Principal Analyst  
[REDACTED] - Principal Advisor  
Grant Blackwell - Principal Scientist  
[REDACTED] - Senior Advisor  
[REDACTED] - Principal Advisor  
[REDACTED] – Project Co-ordinator  
[REDACTED] – Engagement Manager  
[REDACTED] - Engagement and Communication Co-ordinator  
[REDACTED] – Principal Analyst  
[REDACTED] - Operations Manager  
[REDACTED] - Contractor  
[REDACTED] – Principal Analyst  
[REDACTED] – Senior Advisor  
[REDACTED] – Business Analyst  
[REDACTED] – Principal Analyst  
[REDACTED] - Contractor

*The meeting started at 10.00am*

---

## **Agenda Item 1: Board Only time**

- 1.1 The Chair welcomed the Commissioners to the Climate Change Commission Board meeting.
- 1.2 The Board were informed that the Chief Executive will join today's meeting at 11.00am.
- 1.3 The Board noted and acknowledged the passing of Edward Hearnshaw.
- 1.4 The Board discussed the agenda items for today's meeting that includes the Statement of Intent, Statement of Performance Expectation and branding.
- 1.5 The Board discussed the timely delivery of Board papers to Commissioners prior to a Board meeting.
- 1.6 The Board noted that the Chair will discuss with the Chief Executive the timely process of Board papers coming to Commissioners.

*Jo Hendy, ██████████ Grant Blackwell, ██████████ Astrid Nunns and ██████████ joined the meeting at 10.18am*

## **Agenda Item 2: Welcome**

- 2.1 The Chair welcomed the Leadership Team to the Climate Change Commission Board meeting.

## **Additional Agenda Items**

- 2.2 The Board agreed for the Deed of Indemnity agenda item to be brought forward to today's meeting.

## **Review Interest Register**

- 2.3 Catherine Leining informed the Board that she is not directly involved in the Motu Modelling that relates to Agenda Item 12: Analytical Approach but will recuse herself from any Board decisions that could potentially involve a conflict of interest.
- 2.4 The Board noted Catherine Leining's declaration of interest.

## **Approval of Minutes from 12 – 13 May 2020 Board Meeting**

- 2.5 The Minutes from the 12 – 13 May 2020 meeting were reviewed.
- 2.6 The Board discussed the minutes and requested minor amendments to the minutes.

- 2.7 The Board agreed that the Minutes from 12 – 13 May 2020 Climate Change Commission Board meeting, as amended, were confirmed as a true and accurate record of the meeting and signed off by the Chair.

### **Review Actions Register**

- 2.8 Astrid Nunns updated the Board on actions that are in progress and/or completed.
- 2.9 The Board noted the completed actions.

### **Agenda Item 3: Deed of Indemnity**

- 3.1 [REDACTED] provided an update to the Board on the Deed of Indemnity.
- 3.2 The Board acknowledged and thanked [REDACTED] for the work completed on the Commissioners' Deed of Indemnity.
- 3.3 The Board noted and approved the Deed of Indemnity for the Climate Change Commissioners.

### **Agreed**

- 3.4 The Board agreed that, for ease of processing, the Wellington-based Commissioners will sign on behalf of non-Wellington-based Commissioners. [REDACTED] will send an electronic copy of the signed Deeds to the Commissioners. *(Refer to Action Number 0268/2020)*

### **Agenda Item 4: Update from the Chair**

- 4.1 The Chair provided an update to the Board on the recent 6-weekly meeting with Minister James Shaw.

[REDACTED] *left the meeting at 10.54am*

- 4.2 The Chair informed the Board of his recent regular meeting with Vicky Robertson, Secretary for the Environment at the Ministry for the Environment (MfE).
- 4.3 The Board noted that an invitation would be extended to Vicky Robertson to attend a Climate Change Commission Board meeting. *(Refer to Action Number 0269/2020)*

*Jo Hendy joined the meeting at 11.00am*

- 4.4 The Chair provided an update to the Board on the Climate Action Investment Fund.

*The meeting adjourned at 11.06am and reconvened at 11.15am*

[REDACTED] *joined the meeting at 11.15am*

## Agenda Item 5: Climate Change Commission Brand and Ingoa Māori

### Ingoa Māori

- 5.1 Jo Hendy provided an overview of the proposed ingoa Māori, branding and visual identity for the Climate Change Commission to the Board.
- 5.2 ██████████ informed the Board of the creation of a brand which gives the Commission an opportunity to develop a more meaningful Ingoa Māori in line with our developing culture and values.
- 5.3 Lisa Tumahai informed the Board that the name is simple, easy to pronounce and has a beautiful story behind it. He Pou a Rangi - at its simplest can be translated as 'a pillar of the sky'.
- 5.4 The Board acknowledged the gifted ingoa Māori and thanked Lisa Tumahai, Commission staff and advisors to for the work achieved for the meaningful Ingoa Māori.
- 5.5 The Board noted and discussed the proposal for companion Māori name for the Commission.

### Agreed

- 5.6 The Board agreed to adopt the proposed ingoa Māori for the Commission - He Pou a Rangi, Climate Change Commission.
- 5.7 The Board directed that Minister Shaw be advised of the adopted ingoa Māori for the Commission. *(Refer to Action Number 0270/2020)*
- 5.8 The Board noted that they would like a formal launch of He Pou a Rangi at an appropriate time. Commission staff will advise the Board at the next meeting of the approach to this, ensuring relevant advice has been sought.  
*(Refer to Action Number 0271/2020)*

### Climate Change Commission Brand

- 5.9 ██████████ introduced the Climate Change Commission's proposed brand and visual identity to the Board.
- 5.10 ██████████ informed the Board that a strong and recognisable identity would help our stakeholders and New Zealand understand and value the work we do. The logo and accompanying look and feel would distinguish us from other agencies and supports our reputation.
- 5.11 The Board noted and discussed the proposed brand and visual identity for the Commission.

5.12 The Board thanked Commission staff for the progress achieved with the Climate Change Commission brand and visual identity.

**Agreed**

5.13 The Board approved elements of the visual identity, but not the logo. Commission staff will incorporate the discussion points raised by the Board and those points would be progressed at a Board stand-up meeting. *(Refer to Action Number 0272/2020)*

*The meeting adjourned at 12.45pm for lunch. The meeting reconvened at 1.00pm*

[REDACTED] joined the meeting at 1.00pm

**Agenda Item 6: Chief Executive's Report**

6.1 Jo Hendy provided an update to the Board for managing the workload of staff, impacts of COVID-19; staff returning back to the office for week beginning 22 June; and the relationship with the Ministry for the Environment as the Commission's monitoring department.

6.2 The Board noted and discussed the Chief Executive's Report.

6.3 The Board noted that Astrid Nunns is leading the development of the operating agreement with our monitoring department and will keep the Board informed of progress. *(Refer to Action Number 0273/2020)*

**Engagement and Media**

6.4 The Board noted the stakeholder engagement that the Commission has undertaken over the month of May 2020.

**Correspondence and Administrative Matters**

6.5 The Board noted and acknowledged the letter sent from the Commission to Minister Parker responding to the Government's proposed changes to the RMA consenting process; and the letter sent from the Commission to Minister Shaw that provided feedback on the Budget 2020.

6.6 The Board discussed the importance of assessing of the Commission's carbon footprint relating to travel. The Board noted that Jo Hendy will report back to the Board after a discussion with [REDACTED] on the next steps. *(Refer to Action Number 0274/2020)*

## Agenda Item 7: Approval of Draft Statement of Intent and Draft Statement of Performance Expectations

- 7.1 Astrid Nunns provided an update to the Board on moving the Statement of Intent (SOI) and the Statement of Performance Expectations (SPE) to their next phases.
- 7.2 The Board noted the opportunity to review the fully completed draft SPE either at a special meeting or by email later in June.
- 7.3 The Board noted that, following comment by the Commission's monitoring department on the draft SOI, the draft will be provided for consideration to the Minister for Climate Change. The final SOI is due to the Minister mid-July.

### Agreed

- 7.4 The Board approved the draft Statement of Intent to be sent to the monitoring agency (Ministry for the Environment) after essential changes are made.

████████████████████ left the meeting at 2.21pm

██ joined the meeting at 2.22pm

## Agenda Item 8 Engagement Package

- 8.1 ██████████ presented the updated Climate Change Commission's Engagement, Communications and Media strategy and 90 day plans.
- 8.2 ██████████ also provided an update to the Board of the work that is underway over the next 90 days to support the Commission to deliver against this strategy.
- 8.3 The Board noted and discussed the Engagement, Communications and Media strategy and 90 day plans.

### Agreed

- 8.4 The Board requested a marked-up/tracked changes version of the Engagement, Communications and Media Strategy to highlight where recent changes have been made. (Refer to Action Number 0275/2020)
- 8.5 The Board noted that the Comms and Engagement Team will schedule a "LinkedIn tips and tricks" session for Commissioners. (Refer to Action Number 0276/2020)

██ left the meeting at 3.24pm

*The meeting adjourned at 3.24pm. The meeting reconvened at 3.38pm*

██  
████████ joined the meeting at 3.38pm

## Agenda Item 9: Iwi/Māori Focus Workstream

### Te Mahere Whakamua

- 9.1 [REDACTED] presented Te Mahere Whakamua, the project plan for the Māori specific requirements of the broader work programme and provided an overview of the workstreams and deliverables Commission staff are progressing.
- 9.2 The Board noted that Te Mahere Whakamua is focused on establishing the Commission's foundational work to deliver to the Māori specific requirements of the Act.
- 9.3 The Board noted and discussed the workstreams and deliverables of Te Mahere Whakamua.
- 9.4 The Board agreed that training for the Board on the Treaty of Waitangi is essential for the Board's role within the Climate Change Commission. *(Refer to Action Number 0277/2020)*

### Māori Engagement Strategy

- 9.5 [REDACTED] introduced the Māori Engagement Strategy to the Board.
- 9.6 [REDACTED] informed the Board of the Commission's approach to engagement with iwi/Māori for the 12 months to May 2021; drew the links between this approach and the broader workstreams and deliverables set out in Te Mahere Whakamua; and explained the role of the Paepae in this strategy.
- 9.7 The Board noted and discussed the Māori engagement approach over the 12 months to May 2021.

### Agreed

- 9.8 The Board approved the Māori engagement approach for the 12 months to May 2021.
- 9.9 The Board approved the establishment of the Paepae giving it a significant role to play in the development of our advice and requested a further paper on the approach to implementation. *(Refer to Action Number 0278/2020)*
- 9.10 The Board noted that [REDACTED] is to consider a strategy for Māori media. *(Refer to Action Number 0279/2020)*
- 9.11 The Board acknowledged and thanked Lisa Tumahai and [REDACTED] for the work that has been achieved for the Te Mahere Whakamua and Māori Engagement Strategy.

[REDACTED]  
[REDACTED] left the meeting at 4.47pm

**Agenda Item 10: Recap and discuss needs for 10 June 2020 Meeting**

10.1 The Board recapped the day's meeting and discussed the agenda for 10 June.

*The meeting finished at 4.50pm*

*The Climate Change Commission meeting will reconvene at 10.00am on 10 June 2020*



**Climate Change Commission Board Meeting (Meeting 8)**  
**Wednesday, 10 June 2020**

A meeting of the Climate Change Commission Board Members was held via Zoom Teleconference Facility. The meeting started at 10.00am and finished at 4.42pm

**Climate Change Commission Attendees:**

Dr Rod Carr - Chairperson  
Lisa Tumahai - Deputy Chair  
Dr Harry Clark  
Dr Judy Lawrence  
Catherine Leining  
Professor James Renwick  
Professor Nicola Shadbolt

**Invited Attendees:**

Jo Hendy – Chief Executive  
[REDACTED] - Executive Assistant and Minute Taker

**Guests:**

[REDACTED] - Principal Analyst  
[REDACTED] - Principal Analyst  
Astrid Nunns - Director – Strategy and Governance  
[REDACTED] - Analyst  
[REDACTED] - Principal Analyst  
[REDACTED] – Financial Advisor - CASS  
[REDACTED] - Principal Advisor  
[REDACTED] – Senior Analyst  
Grant Blackwell - Principal Scientist  
[REDACTED] - Principal Analyst  
[REDACTED] - Engagement Manager  
[REDACTED] - Consultant  
[REDACTED] - Principal Advisor  
[REDACTED] - Operations Manager  
[REDACTED] - Senior Analyst  
[REDACTED] - Principal Analyst  
[REDACTED] - Principal Analyst  
[REDACTED] - Principal Analyst  
[REDACTED] - Secretary General, New Zealand Red Cross  
[REDACTED] - Recovery Manager, New Zealand Red Cross  
[REDACTED] - Recovery Manager, New Zealand Red Cross

*The meeting started at 10.00am*

---

Jo Hendy, [REDACTED] Astrid Nunns, Grant Blackwell, [REDACTED]  
[REDACTED]

*joined the meeting at 10.00am*

#### Agenda Item 11: New Zealand Red Cross Presentation

- 11.1 [REDACTED] introduced [REDACTED] from the NZ Red Cross to the Board.
- 11.2 The Board and the NZ Red Cross noted that the presentation will be recorded for Commission staff to view.
- 11.3 [REDACTED] presented to the Board on the experience of the Red Cross on the impacts of climate change and the COVID-19 pandemic at a global and community level.
- 11.4 The Board expressed their appreciation to the New Zealand Red Cross for their presentation and the work they are doing with the impacts of climate change and the COVID-19 pandemic.
- 11.5 Due to time constraints for the presentation, Commissioners were informed that they could send their questions to [REDACTED] who would in turn, pass onto the NZ Red Cross.

[REDACTED] *left the meeting at 11.00am*

[REDACTED] *joined the meeting at 11.00am*

#### Agenda Item 12: Analytical Approach

- 12.1 Jo Hendy informed the Board that Commission staff are presenting a high-level outline of the analytical approach that Commission staff will take to pull together all the pieces of analysis for the Commission's advice that needs to be delivered in 2021.
- 12.2 [REDACTED] introduced the paper to the Board that provides an overview of the main elements of the analysis that the Commission will undertake to support this advice. It also lays out how these elements are expected to fit together in the Commission's final advice.
- 12.3 The Board noted and discussed the proposed approach that Commission staff would take in the analytical approach for putting together their analysis.

## **Agreed**

- 12.4 The Board agreed that Commissioners would provide any follow up feedback either in writing or verbally to Commission staff for the proposed analytical approach. (*Refer to Action Number 0280/2020*)

*Jo Hendy left the meeting at 12.25pm*

*Astrid Nunns left the meeting at 12.29pm*

- 12.5 The Board agreed that Agenda 10 on Analytical Approach will continue the discussion at this afternoon's Board meeting.

*Grant Blackwell, [REDACTED] left the meeting at 12.40pm*

*The meeting adjourned at 12.40pm for lunch. The meeting reconvened at 1.00pm*

*[REDACTED] Astrid Nunns, [REDACTED] and Grant Blackwell joined the meeting at 1.00pm*

## **Agenda Item 13: Corporate Services**

### **Financial Update**

- 13.1 [REDACTED] provided an update to the Board on the financial position of the Commission to 31 May 2020 and forecasting to 30 June 2020.
- 13.2 [REDACTED] also reported that CASS has created budget packs in the financial management system and is now tracking actuals vs budget and that work is underway separately on setting the budget for 2020/21 and beyond.
- 13.3 The Board noted that the Chair and Deputy Chair are meeting with Audit NZ to discuss providing an Auditor to the Climate Change Commission.
- 13.4 [REDACTED] informed the Board that their invoices are to be with CASS by 30 June as this is the end of the financial year. If the Commissioners are not able to finalise these, an estimate of what they expect to bill would be helpful to accrue these amounts.

*[REDACTED] Grant Blackwell and Astrid Nunns left the meeting at 1.20pm*

## **Agenda Item 14: Update on Tier 2 Recruitment**

- 14.1 Jo Hendy provided an update to the Board on the recruitment of three Tier 2 roles for the Chief Science Advisor; the General Manager – Corporate Services and Governance; and the General Manager - Strategy, Engagement and Planning.

- 14.2 Jo Hendy informed the Board that formal verbal offers had been made and accepted. Subsequent to reference checks, offer letters have been delivered to the successful candidates.

*Jo Hendy left the meeting at 1.30pm*

**[REDACTED]** Grant Blackwell, **[REDACTED]** joined the meeting at 1.30pm

#### **Agenda Item 15: Board Advisors Approach**

- 15.1 **[REDACTED]** provided a presentation to the Board on the proposed ways of working with Board Advisors and a draft list of which Commissioners could act as Board Advisors for each sector and theme.
- 15.2 The Board noted the contents of the presentation and the guidance provided by Commission staff.
- 15.3 The Board discussed the proposed themes/sector and the proposed Board Advisors for each sector/theme.

#### **Agreed**

- 15.4 The Board approved the themes/sectors which will have Board Advisors, and the agreed Board members for each.
- 15.5 The Board agreed that they would provide six bullet points to the Team Leads outlining their knowledge and expertise for each of their designated Board Advisor themes/sectors. *(Refer to Action Number 0281/2020)*
- 15.6 The Board noted that Commission staff key contacts would arrange introductory discussions with Board Advisors. *(Refer to Action Number 0282/2020)*
- 15.7 The Board noted that Commission staff would keep a log of all requests to Board Advisors, with a view to monitoring demands on Board Advisors' time. *(Refer to Action Number 0283/2020)*
- 15.8 The Board noted that a review of Board Advisors approach would be scheduled after three months to ensure the approach is fit for purpose. *(Refer to Action Number 0284/2020)*

**[REDACTED]**  
**[REDACTED]** joined the meeting at 2.00pm

## Agenda Item 12: Analytical Approach – Continued Discussion

### Principals for Target Accounting

- 12.6 [REDACTED] proposed that the Commission should take a principles-based approach for its advice on target accounting for the first three emissions budgets and how these may realistically be met.
- 12.7 The Board noted and discussed the framework of principles to guide decisions and advice on accounting.

### Agreed

- 12.8 The Board agreed to adopt a principles-based approach to its advice on target accounting and noted that Commission staff would keep the Board updated as work on developing and implementing the principles progressed.

## Agenda Item 16: Structure of the Waste Sector Report

The Board agreed to defer Agenda Item 16. The Waste Sector Report structure will be discussed at a later date.

## Agenda Item 17: Structure of the Land Sector Report

- 17.1 [REDACTED] introduced the technical briefing paper to the Board on the land sector chapter outline and key considerations on cross cutting issues.
- 17.2 [REDACTED] also introduced to the Board the proposed structure for the land sector report and information on the land sector modelling approach.
- 17.3 The Board noted and discussed the land sector chapter outline and key considerations on cross cutting issues.

### Approved

- 17.4 The Board approved the overall structure of the land sector report. It is built on the outline of the scope and structure of the final reports for May 2021 that was agreed at the March Board meeting (11 March 2020 - Agenda Item 8.4). Board member comments were noted for consideration and inclusion in the report.

[REDACTED]  
[REDACTED] left the meeting at 3.20pm

*The meeting adjourned at 3.20pm and reconvened at 3.28pm*

## Agenda Item 12: Analytical Approach – Continued Discussion

### Key Judgements for the Commission

- 12.9 [REDACTED] informed the Board on the key judgements that the Commission is required to make under the Act and Terms of Reference.
- 12.10 [REDACTED] also informed the Board on the principles for helping to make those judgements.
- 12.11 The Board noted and discussed the key judgements and analysis that will inform them.
- 12.12 The Board noted and discussed the impacts of COVID-19 for short term economic shock and changes in long term trends as a result of the pandemic.

*Jo Hendy joined the meeting at 3.45pm*

- 12.13 The Board thanked and acknowledged Commission staff for their informative Analytical Approach paper.

[REDACTED] *left the meeting at 4.00pm*

[REDACTED] *joined the meeting at 4.00pm*

## Agenda Item 18: Social Discounting and the Social Discount Rate

- 18.1 [REDACTED] introduced the Social Discounting and the Social Discount Rate paper to the Board. The purpose of this paper is to determine a Commission position on how and when social discount rates will be used in our analysis.
- 18.2 [REDACTED] informed the Board that the paper covers the role and effect of social discount rates, methods of discounting, and discount rates that the Commission might use. From this analysis, a recommendation of discounting methods and social discount rates is made. Private discount rates will be discussed in a later paper.
- 18.3 [REDACTED] also informed the Board that the work has been tested inside and outside the Commission, including with the consultants from Motu and Concept Consulting who are building quantitative economic models for the Commission.
- 18.4 The Board noted and discussed the social discount rates, methods of discounting and the discount rates the Commission might use.
- 18.5 The Board noted the significant limitations of discounting future costs and benefits as part of a decision-making framework, particularly in cases where distributional and intergenerational considerations are significant.

- 18.6 The Board agreed that the Commission would avoid using discount rates where technically possible.
- 18.7 The Board agreed that in the case of social discount rates, the Commission will use a constant exponential discounting approach with:
- 1) a headline rate aligned with the lower NZ Treasury rate (currently 3%);
  - 2) an upper sensitivity aligned with the higher NZ Treasury rate (currently 6%); and
  - 3) lower sensitivities of 1% and 0%.
- 18.8 The Board agreed that these values would be used only for the purposes of providing advice on mitigation costs related to the first three emissions budgets and the first emissions reduction plan, and that the Board would subsequently revisit its approach to social discounting in other contexts, such as valuing actual or avoided climate change damages.
- 18.9 The Board requested further work on discounting be scheduled. (*Refer to Action Number 0285/2020*)

#### **Next meeting Date**

The next monthly meeting of the Climate Change Commission Board will be held on 14 and 15 July 2020 via Zoom Teleconferencing.

*The meeting finished at 4.42pm*

*These minutes have been accepted as a true and accurate record by the Board of the Climate Change Commission.*

Signed:

Chair

Date:

15/7/2020