

OIA ref: 2021-032

Privacy

Privacy Lawyers for Climate Action NZ Inc.

Privacy @lawyersforclimateaction.nz

14 September 2021

Official information request relating to the Commission's advice *Ināia tonu nei: a low emissions future for Aotearoa* 

Kia ora

Privacy

### Official Information Act Request 2021-032

I refer to your request for information dated 8 June 2021, in which you requested the following information under the Official Information Act (**OIA**):

Please supply, under the Official Information Act 1982, the following information relating to the advice given by the Climate Change Commission (the Commission) to the Minister for Climate Change (the Minister) under s 5ZA of the Climate Change Response Act 2002 (the Act) on 31 May 2021 (the Advice):

- a. correspondence or other communications (including notes of meetings or calls) between the Commission and the Minister and between the Commission and the Ministry for the Environment (MfE) in relation to the preparation of the Advice or how the Commission should undertake its task;
- b. any analysis undertaken by the Commission of the appropriate framework for determining the recommended quantity of emissions that will be permitted in each emissions budget period under s 5Z(1)(a) of the Act;
- c. any analysis undertaken by the Commission of the cost of reducing emissions by way of domestic emissions reductions and domestic removals relative to the cost of offshore mitigation;
- d. any analysis undertaken by the Commission of the consistency of its recommended emissions budgets with New Zealand's obligations under the Paris Agreement; and
- e. any analysis undertaken by the Commission of whether the interquartile range for the reduction of CO2 identified in the 2018 IPCC Special Report on Global Warming of 1.5  $^{\circ}$ C (that is, -40% to -58% by 2030) should be applied to New Zealand's 2010 levels of gross CO2 or net CO2.





In relation to (b) to (e), we seek emails, memoranda, reports, meeting notes, minutes etc which relate to each of these topics. We do not seek material that is publicly available on the Commission's website or that is included in the advice itself.

### **Background**

On 16 June 2021, the Commission sought refinement of your request, notifying you that, as per section 15(1AA) of the Official Information Act 1982 (**OIA**), the Commission would treat any refinement as a new request for the purposes of calculating the maximum statutory timeframe for response.

On 21 June 2021 you agreed to refine part (a) of your request to exclude non-substantive, process-focused emails, and you agreed to refine parts (b) through (e) of your request to exclude any process-focused emails as well as any emails about the specified subjects that do not contain analysis.

On 20 July 2021 the Commission notified you that it was extending the timeframe for the request until 14 September 2021, under ss 15A(1)(a) and (b) of the OIA.

On 19 August 2021, the Commission sought further clarification from you as to the scope of the request. In particular:

- whether the request extended to the Commission's advice on New Zealand's Nationally
  Determined Contribution (the NDC), provided to government under s 5K of the Climate Change
  Response Act 2002; and
- in relation to part (a) of the request, whether you sought correspondence or other communications between the Commission and the Minister and between the Commission and the Ministry for the Environment at a working-group level (that is, analysts at the Commission (who are not in senior management).

On 20 August 2021, you confirmed that the request:

- extended to the Commission's advice on the NDC; and
- with respect to part (a) of the request, correspondence or other communications at working-group level.

#### Response

As noted in our previous correspondence, the Commission is responding to this OIA request in two tranches. The first tranche, which we provided to you on 1 September 2021, included the documents that the Commission understood to be within the scope of the request prior to your clarification on 20 August 2021.

This second tranche includes the documents that fall within scope of the request following your clarification on 20 August 2021. That is:

- material relating to the Commission's advice on the NDC; and
- correspondence or other communications between the Commission and the Minister and between the Commission and the Ministry for the Environment (MfE) at a working-group level in relation to the preparation of the Advice or how the Commission should undertake its task.

The document schedule appended to this request lists the second tranche of documents that fall within the scope of this request. Please note, some material has been with withheld under the following sections of the Act:

- Section 9(2)(a), to protect the privacy of individuals;
- Section 9(2)(b)(ii), to protect information where the making available of the information would be likely unreasonably to prejudice the commercial position of the person who supplied or who is the subject of the information;
- Section 9(2)(g)(i), to maintain the effective conduct of public affairs through the free and frank expression of opinion; and
- Section 9(2)(h), to maintain legal professional privilege.

Where information has been withheld under section 9(2), the Commission does not consider that the withholding of this information is outweighed by public interest considerations in making the information available. Publicly available information has been refused under section 18(d) of the Act and out of scope and duplicated material has been removed.

### Other matters

You have the right by way of complaint to the Ombudsman under s 28(3) of the OIA to seek an investigation and review of this response. Information about how to make a complaint is available at www.ombudsman.parliament.nz or freephone 0800 802 602.

Please note that the Commission has a policy to proactively release OIA responses to help others have access to more information. Consequently, this letter will be published on our website with your name and contact details redacted to protect your privacy.

Nga mini	
Privacy	
Climate Change Commission	

3

Doc	Page	Date	Document	Title/Subject	Redactions/Notes
No.	No.		Туре		
	nse Bund			T -	T
1	1	3 April	Email	RE: [UNCLASSIFIED] CCC input	Some information has been withheld under s
	+	2020		into deadline paper	9(2)(a).
2	2	6 April	Email	FW: Material from the CCC on	Some information has been withheld under s
	<del> </del>	2020		CCRA deadlines	9(2)(a).
2a	2a 3-7		Attachment	Paper on revising the Feb 2021	
				deadline.v3.docx – Attachment to	
				FW: Material from the CCC on	
2	0.0	7 01	F11	CCRA deadlines of 6 April 2020	Constitution has been withheld and an
3	8-9	7 April	Email	RE: [UNCLASSIFIED] RE: Material	Some information has been withheld under s
4	10.11	2020	Email	from the CCC on CCRA deadlines	9(2)(a).  Some information has been withheld under s
4	10-11	8 April 2020	Email	RE: [UNCLASSIFIED] Just checking	
5	12-13		Email	in	9(2)(a).
5	12-13	30 Sept 2020	Email	RE: Update on Commission	Some information withheld under s 9(2)(a).
6	14-15	15 Oct	Email	modelling  Por MEE CCC Wasta Projections	Some information has been withheld under s
O	14-15	2020	Email	Re: MFE-CCC Waste Projections	
		2020			9(2)(a).
6a	16-20		Attachment	Memo mentioned in email of 13	
				October 2020 at 2:21 pm -	
				Improvements to the Waste	
				sector planned for the 2021 GHG	
	1			inventory submission	
7	21-22	27 Oct	Email	[UNCLASSIFIED] RE: October 2020	Some information has been withheld under s
		2020		update – IPPU GHG emissions	9(2)(a).
				projections	
7a	23-30		Attachment	Excel Attachment to Email titled -	
				RE: October 2020 update – IPPU	
				GHG emissions projections	
8	31-32	15 Feb	Email	RE: Distributional impacts	Some information has been withheld under s
		2021			9(2)(a).
9	33-37	26 Feb	Email	RE: [UNCLASSIFIED] RE: Yet more	Some information has been withheld under s
		2021		complications on publishing a	9(2)(a).
				paper on updated waste methods	
10	38-43	1 June	Email	FW: Modelling Q & A –	Some information has been withheld under s
		2021		Interagency officials to meet with	9(2)(a) and s 9(2)(h). Out of scope material
				the Commission's modelling	has been withheld.
				analyst team to understand	
				modelling	
11	44	1 June	Email	RE: Collating questions	Some information has been withheld under s
		2021			9(2)(a).
12	45	7 April	Email	FW: copy of your paper on ethical	Some information has been withheld under s
12	43	2021	Lilidii	choices	9(2)(a).
	1				5(2)(a).
<b>12</b> a	46-51	23 April	Attachment	Ethical choices behind	
	1	2021		quantifications of fair	
				contributions under the Paris	
				Agreement	

	1	1	T		
13	52	23 April 2021	Email	FW: 9(2)(a) MfE staff member's explanation of target accounting FW: Reporting and accounting of	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a).
				emissions from land-use and	
13a	53-56		Attachment	forestry  Reporting and accounting of	
250	33 30		ricedenniche	emissions from land-use and	
				forestry.docx	
14	57-61	1 June	Email	RE: [IN-CONFIDENCE] In-	Some information has been withheld under s
		2021		confidence: updated Commission	9(2)(a).
				Current Policy reference baseline	
14a	62-65		Attachment	F gases data.xlsx	
14b	N/A		Attachment	NZ NDC calculator 20210507-	Note: Due to its size, this spreadsheet has not
				working.xlsx	been converted to pdf. It will be sent to you via email as an .xslsx file.
Respor	nse Bund	le 2	<u> </u>		I
15	66-69	25	Email	RE_ Draft terms of reference -	Some information has been withheld under s
		Feb 2020		Climate Change Commission request	9(2)(a).
15a	70-72		Attachment	Draft terms of reference - Climate	Some information has been withheld under s
				Change Commission request	9(2)(a).
16	73-75	2 March 2020	Email	RE_ Draft terms of reference for CCC.pdf	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a).
17	76-77	3 March 2020	Email	RE_ Draft terms of reference for CCC	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a).
17a	78-80		Attachment	Draft Terms of Reference – Climate Change Commission request.docx	
17b	n/a		Attachment	Draft Terms of Reference – Climate Change Commission request.pdf	Not released as same as doc 17a above.
18	81-83	30 Nov 2020	Email	[UNCLASSIFIED] RE- [IN- CONFIDENCE] Shared evidence base	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a).
18a	84		Attachment	Attachments mentioned in email of 24 Nov 2020 at 4:32 pm – draft chatpers - Draft Advice.	Attachments are withheld under section 9(2)(g)(i). Final versions of the chapters attached are available online at: <a href="Draft advice">Draft advice</a> report and documents » Climate Change Commission (climatecommission.govt.nz).
19	85-87	30 Nov 2020	Email	RE: [UNCLASSIFIED] Draft Climate Change Commission Waste chapter for facts and accuracy checking.pdf	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a).
20	88-89	30 Nov 2020	Email	[UNCLASSIFIED] RE: Draft Climate Change Commission Waste	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a).

				chapter for facts and accuracy checking	
20a	90		Attachment	Evidence Ch04d – Waste reducing emissions SENT FOR PEER REVIEW.docx	Withheld in full under s 9(2)(g)(i)—see document xxx below. Final version of the Chapter is available at: <a href="Evidence-CH-04d-Reducing-emissions-Waste-20-Jan-2021.pdf">Evidence-CH-04d-Reducing-emissions-Waste-20-Jan-2021.pdf</a> (amazonaws.com)
21	91-92	1 Dec 2020	Email	[UNCLASSIFIED] For fact checking and accuracy checking on Climate Change Commission Evidence Report Chapter	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a).
21a	93		Attachment	Evidence CH Impacts – for external review.docx	Withheld in full under s 9(2)(g)(i). Final version of the Chapter is available at:  Evidence-CH-12-How-we-earn-our-way-in-the-world-20-Jan-2021.pdf (amazonaws.com)
22	94	1 Dec 2020	Email	[UNCLASSIFIED] For peer review- fact checking and accuracy checking of Climate Change Commission Evidence report	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a).
22a	95		Attachment	Evidence Ch04d – Waste reducing emissions SENT FOR PEER REVIEW.docx	Withheld in full under s 9(2)(g)(i). Final version of the Chapter is available at: <u>Evidence-CH-04d-Reducing-emissions-Waste-20-Jan-2021.pdf (amazonaws.com)</u>
23	96-97	2 Dec 2020	Email	RE: [UNCLASSIFIED] For peer review- fact checking and accuracy checking of Climate Change Commission Evidence report	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a).
24	98- 100	2 Dec 2020	Email	RE: [UNCLASSIFIED] For peer review-fact checking and accuracy checking of Climate Change Commission Evidence report	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a).
25	101	2 Dec 2020	Email	RE: [UNCLASSIFIED] For peer review- fact checking and accuracy checking of Climate Change Commission Evidence report	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a).
26	102- 104	4 Dec 2020	Email	2020-12-4-RE_ [UNCLASSIFIED] Draft Climate Change Commission Waste chapter - with attachment.pdf	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a).
26a	105		Attachment	Evidence Ch04d – Waste reducing emissions SENT FOR PEER REVIEW – MfE comments.docx	Withheld in full under s 9(2)(g)(i). Final version of the Chapter is available at: <u>Evidence-CH-04d-Reducing-emissions-Waste-20-Jan-2021.pdf (amazonaws.com)</u>
27	106- 107	7 Dec 2020	Email	RE: [UNCLASSIFIED] For peer review- fact checking and accuracy checking of Climate	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a).

				Change Commission Evidence report	
27a	108		Attachment	Evidence Ch04d – Waste reducing emissions SENT FOR PEER REVIEW.docx	Withheld in full under s 9(2)(g)(i). Final version of the Chapter is available at: <u>Evidence-CH-04d-Reducing-emissions-Waste-20-Jan-2021.pdf (amazonaws.com)</u>
28	109	26 August 2020	Email	RE: [UNCLASSIFIED] Question about MFE baselines and Waste Minimisation Plans	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a).
29	110- 112	8 Sept 2020	Email	RE: [UNCLASSIFIED] F Gasses?	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a).
30	113- 114	2 Oct 2020	Email	FW: Waste minimisation policy emission reduction potential - a circular economy approach (TRG feedback)	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a).
30a	115- 121		Attachment	Waste minimisation policy emission reduction potential – a circular economy approach	
31	122	5 Nov 2020	Email	A Draft Reference Case Chapter for Review	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a).
31a	123		Attachment	FOR REVIEW_Evidence CH Modelling & Baselines_version to 9(2)(a) - MfE staffer 05.11.20.docx	Withheld in full under 9(2)(g)(i). Final version of the Chapter is available at: <a href="Evidence-CH-07-Where-we-are-currently-heading-26-Jan-2021-compressed-1.pdf">Evidence-CH-07-Where-we-are-currently-heading-26-Jan-2021-compressed-1.pdf</a> (amazonaws.com).
Respoi	nse Bund	le 3			
32	124	15 Jan 2020	Email	CCC modelling of forest carbon	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a).
33	125- 126	4 March 2020	Email	RE: TRG #4 Land Use + lunch invitation	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a).
34	127- 128	14 April 2020	Email	RE: Forests_ Herbivores and Carbon Stocks	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a).
35	129- 130	17 April 2020	Email	RE: Forests, Herbivores and Carbon Stocks	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a).
35a	131		Attachment	wild-animal-control-emissions- management.pdf	Refused under section 18(d), as publicly available at: Wild Animal Control for Emissions Management (WACEM) research synthesis (doc.govt.nz).
36	132- 135	20 April 2020	Email	RE: Forests, Herbivores and Carbon Stocks.	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a).
37	136- 137	24 April 2020	Email	RE: [UNCLASSIFIED] call?	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a).
38	138- 139	24 April 2020	Email	RE: Native forests and pests	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a).
39	140- 142	3 June 2020	Email	RE: Request for access to municipal waste model	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a).

40	143-	3 June 2020	Email	RE: Request for access to municipal waste model	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a).
41	144- 147	11 June 2020	Email	RE: [UNCLASSIFIED] FW: Request for access to municipal waste model	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a).
42	148- 149	24 June 2020	Email	RE: MfE TRG observer - and a chat sometime?	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a).
43	150- 151	30 June 2020	Email	RE: Counting Forests' emissions and removals in budgets and targets	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a).
44	152- 153	30 June 2020	Email	RE: Counting Forests' emissions and removals in budgets and targets	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a).
45	154-	30 July 2020	Email	AR4 vs AR5	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a).
46	155- 156	17 Sept 2020	Email	RE:[UNCLASSIFIED] RE: Discussing the Emission Budgets process with the HWEN Pricing workstream	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a).
47	157	30 Sept 2020	Email	Three pillars	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a).
47a	158		Attachment	How pricing emissions supports the low emissions transition at manageable cost to the economy.pptx	
48	159	24 Nov 2020	Email	A Evidence CH Sector Focus Removals - Options Challenges MfE VIEW	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a).
48a	160		Attachment	Evidence CH Sector Focus Removals - Options Challenges SENT FOR REVIEW.docx	Withheld in full under s 9(2)(g)(i). Final version of the Chapter is available at:  Evidence-CH-05-Removing-carbon-from-our-atmosphere-19-Jan-2021.pdf (amazonaws.com).
49	161- 166	26 Nov 2020	Email	Emissions reductions through carbon stored in HWP and the substitution effects of these products	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a).
49a	167		Attachment	ffgc-03-00058.pdf	Refused under section 18(d), as the paper attached is publicly available at: Frontiers   Forests and Decarbonization – Roles of Natural and Planted Forests   Forests and Global Change (frontiersin.org).
50	168	26 Nov 2020	Email	CCC / MPI / MfE discussion on forest issues	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a).
51	169	3 Dec 2020	Email	RE: Paul et al 2019 reference -	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a).

51a	170		Attachment	Carbon stocks and change in natural forests.pdf	Refused under s 18(d) as available at: <u>Carbon stocks and change in New Zealand's natural forests   Ministry for the Environment</u> .
52	171- 174	12 Feb 2021	Email	RE: CCC advice question - 2018 emissions.pdf	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a).
53	175- 178	26 Feb 2021	Email	FW: Native forests and pests	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a).
54	179	17 March 2021	Email	Afforestation	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a).
54a	180- 190		Attachment	Afforestation economic analysis.xlsx	
55	191	25 March 2021		RE: Afforestation	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a).
55a	192		Attachment	DRAFT Assumptions CCC Natives Complementary/Analysis.xlsx	
56	193	22 June 2021		RE: pre-1990 natural deforestation.pdf	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a).
Respor	nse Bund	le 4		1	
57	194- 196	3 March 2020	Email	RE: publishing responses to CCC's call for evidence	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a).
58	197- 198	9 June 2020	Email	RE: [UNCLASSIFIED] NDC work	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a).
58a	199- 201		Attachment	ConsistencyWithScenarios.docx	
58b	202		Attachment	05-2020-B-06407 Scientific analysis of compatibility of the NDC with 1.5 degrees.pdf	Refused under section 18(d), as publicly available at: <a href="scientific-analysis-of-compatibility-of-ndc-with-1.5-degrees.pdf">scientific-analysis-of-compatibility-of-ndc-with-1.5-degrees.pdf</a> (environment.govt.nz).
59	203- 204	23 June 2020	Email	Re: [UNCLASSIFIED] NDC accounting	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a).
59a	205- 211		Attachment	Reporting accounting document 13 05 2020.docx	
60	212- 215	15 July 2020	Email	RE: [UNCLASSIFIED] Potential work for NZ's Climate Change Commission	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a) and 9(2)(g)(i).
61	216	4 Aug 2020	Email	[UNCLASSIFIED] ETS team / Commission meeting 3.30pm 10 August	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a).
62	217	2 Oct 2020	Email	RE: [UNCLASSIFIED] Seeking Croissant	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a).
Respor	nse Bund	le 5	1	I	1
63	218- 219	4 Feb 2020	Email	Climate Commission's impacts work - affiliation on Stats Data Lab project	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a).

63a	220- 240		Attachment	CCC ClimateChangePolicy Impacts application-access-microdata- stats-data-lab-New-Project - 4 Feb 2020.docx	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a) and s 9(2)(b)(ii).  Note: This was a draft application – not the final version submitted to Stats NZ.
64	241- 243	17 Feb 2020	Email	FW_ Climate Commission's impacts work - affiliation on Stats Data Lab project	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a).
64a	244		Attachment	Attachment mentioned in the email of 14 Feb 2020 at 4.28pm.	Not released as same as document <i>63a</i> above.
65	245- 246	23 April 2020	Email	[UNCLASSIFIED] Draft MOU with Climate Commission on developing a shared evidence base	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a).
65a	247- 251		Attachment	draft MOU sharing information and evidence.docx	
65b	252- 264		Attachment	MOU between CCC and govts UK.pdf	
66	265- 270	1 June 2021	Email	FW: [IN-CONFIDENCE] In- confidence: updated Commission Current Policy Reference baseline	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a).
66a	271		Attachment		As allowed for under s 16 (1)(e), a summary of the attached data is provided to ensure the confidentiality of the sectors and organisations whose data is included. The summarized data is available at: <a href="https://ccc-production-media.s3.ap-southeast-2.amazonaws.com/public/Inaia-tonu-nei-a-low-emissions-future-for-Aotearoa/Modelling-files/Scenarios-dataset-2021-final-advice.xlsx">https://ccc-production-media.s3.ap-southeast-2.amazonaws.com/public/Inaia-tonu-nei-a-low-emissions-future-for-Aotearoa/Modelling-files/Scenarios-dataset-2021-final-advice.xlsx</a> .
67	272	10 Aug 2020	Meeting invite	MfE & CCC	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a).
68	273	1 Feb 2021	Email	RE: copy of numbers in advice scenario?	Some information has been withheld under s 9(2)(a).
68a	274		Attachment	Advice report key charts and data 2021-02-01.xlsx	Refused under 18(d) as the data is publicly available at: <a href="https://ccc-production-media.s3.ap-southeast-2.amazonaws.com/public/2021-Draft-Advice-Report-charts-and-data-v3.xlsx">https://ccc-production-media.s3.ap-southeast-2.amazonaws.com/public/2021-Draft-Advice-Report-charts-and-data-v3.xlsx</a> .

# Documents withheld in full under s 9(2)(g)(i)

Doc No.	Date	Document Type	Title/Subject
69	16 Oct 2020	Email	RE: Projections
70	27 Oct 2020	Email	RE: Model access
71	6 Nov 2020	Email	RE: Draft Reference Case Chapter for Review
72	9 Nov 2020	Email	RE: Draft Reference Case Chapter for Review
72a		Attachment	FOR REVIEW_Evidence CH Modelling Baselines_version to MfE staffer-Privacy 05.11.20 _ MfE_comments.docx
73	14 Dec 2020	Email	RE: Clean car modelling
74	31 January 2021	Email	copy of numbers in advice scenario?
75	1 March 2021	Email	RE: Access to the latest inventory stats
76	3 March 2021	Email	RE: CCC/MfE discussion on draft advice
77	5 March 2021	Email	RE: [UNCLASSIFIED] Reference case comparison
78	10 March 2021	Email	RE: Energy (mainly HIP) technical Q&A session with the CCC, MBIE and EECA – Notes
79	11 March 2021	Email	RE: Access to the latest inventory stats
80	11 March 2021	Email	RE: Access to the latest inventory stats (in-confidence)
81	19 March 2021	Email	RE: [UNCLASSIFIED] RE: Aluminium
82	19 March 2021	Email	RE: [UNCLASSIFIED] RE: feedback on the emissions reduction pathway for HFCs
83	22 March 2021	Email	RE: Agriculture baseline
84	24 March 2021	Email	RE: Access to the latest inventory stats (in-confidence)
85	7 April 2021	Email	RE: Access to the latest inventory stats (in-confidence)
86	9 April 2021	Email	RE: HIP and Refrigerants
86a		Attachment	Attachment 1 to RE: HIP and Refrigerants email
86b		Attachment	Attachment 2 Excel spreadsheet to be attached
87	28 April 2021	Email	RE: A couple of questions
88	29 April	Email	RE: Baselines and final report
89	19 May 2021	Email	RE: CCC baselines followup
90	26 May 2021	Email	RE: Baselines
91	31 May 2021	Email	RE: [In-confidence] In-confidence updated Commission Current Policy Reference baseline
92	24 June 2021	Email	RE: Construction and Waste
93	24 Feb 2020	Email	RE: quick industrial allocation question
94	4 Aug 2020	Email	RE: [UNCLASSIFIED] Meeting to discuss international carbon markets
95	3 Sept 2020	Email	FW: [UNCLASSIFIED] Question on natural forest area
96	29 Sept 2020	Email	ETS discussion (2 <sup>nd</sup> go)
97	16 Oct 2020	Email	RE: Three pillars

97a		Attachment	How pricing emissions supports the low emissions transition at manageable cost to economy.pptx	
98	5 Nov 2020	Email	RE: [UNCLASSIFIED] RE: Oct 2020 waste sector GHG projections 2019-2050	
98a		Attachment	Referred to in email of 2 Nov 2020 at 11:00 am - Solid waste activity data from Oct 2020 projections for CCC.xlsx	
98b		Attachment	Referred to in email of 23 Oct 2020 at 1:48 pm - FINAL Emissions projections template Oct 2020 - Waste and Tokelau.xlsx	
98c		Attachment	Referred to in email of 23 Oct 2020 at 1:48 pm - FINAL Waste sector projections methods for Oct 2020	
99	18 Nov 2020	Email	RE: Next catch-ups; re NDC advice, and on scenario guidance	
100	2 Dec 2020	Email	RE: [UNCLASSIFIED] Information for our models?	
101	3 Dec 2020	Email	[UNCLASSIFIED] Fw: To discuss: review of impacts chapter	
102	15 Feb 2021	Email	FW: Projections differences	
103	22 Feb 2021	Email	[UNCLASSIFIED] FW: Commission budget annual breakdown	
104	24 Feb 2021	Email	RE: [UNCLASSIFIED] RE: Waste data session with MfE	
104a		Attachment	Attachment connected to email of 24 February 2021, titled, RE: [UNCLASSIFIED] RE: Waste data session with MfE email of	
105	17 March 2021	Email	[UNCLASSIFIED] RE: Commission – MfE baseline projections differences in waste	
106	31 March 2021	Email	RE: Discussion with MfE on emissions budgets modelling	
107	1 April 2021	Email	ETS modelling	
108	7 April 2021	Email	RE: Waste projections	
109	9 April 2021	Email	RE: Transport projections	
110	15 April 2021	Email	RE: Investigation of CCC and MPI forest models	
111	5 Aug 2020	Email	RE: [UNCLASSIFIED] RE: AR4 vs AR5	
112	5 Feb 2021	Email	RE: NDC	
113	23 Feb 2021	Email	ETS changes for forestry	
114	1 March 2021	Email	RE: [UNCLASSIFIED] 2020 target level query	
115	16 March 2021	Email	Re: CCC/MfE discussion on draft advice 4th March	
115a		Attachment	WCB Methodology Report_5 October (Public).pdf;	
115b		Attachment	Wider Costs and Benefits of Urban Growth - A Simple Guide.pdf	
116	22 March 2021	Email	RE: [UNCLASSIFIED] Follow up on NDC	
117	24 March 2021	Email	RE: CCC/MfE discussion on draft advice 4th March	
118	9 April 2021	Email	minor factual corrections to draft advice	
118a		Attachment	Suggested corrections to CCC draft from 31 Jan 2021.xlsx	
Respon	Response Bundle 2 – Documents withheld in full under 9(2)(g)(i)			
119	3 March 2020	Meeting Invite	Accepted_ Forest accounting follow up_ reference levels	
120	7 July 2020	Meeting Invite	Canceled- Forest accounting follow up- reference levels - Meeting	
121	9 Dec 2020	Email	"Averaging" chart	

122	24 March 2021	Email	CH4 emisssions from waterways due to eutrophication
123	9 Sept 2020	Email	RE: [UNCLASSIFIED] RE: Notes from the TRG meeting and feedback wanted on scenario assumptions
124	9 Sept 2020	EmaiL	RE: [UNCLASSIFIED] RE: Notes from the TRG meeting and feedback wanted on scenario assumptions.pdf
124a		Attachment	MfE feedback to the TRG on targets proposed by the CCC Aug 2020.docx
125	2 Oct 2020	Email	FW: Waste minimisation policy emission reduction potential - a circular economy approach (TRG feedback)
125a		Attachment	FW Waste minimisation policy emission reduction potential - a circular economy approach (TRG feedback).pdf
126	14 April 2021	Email	FW: [UNCLASSIFIED] RE_ Notes from the TRG meeting and feedback wanted on scenario assumptions
126a		Attachment	MfE feedback to the TRG on targets proposed by the CCC Aug 2020.docx
127	5 Nov 2020	Email	Draft Reference Case Chapter for Review
127a		Attachment	FOR REVIEW_Evidence CH Modelling & Baselines_version to Privacy - MfE staffer 05.11.20.docx
128	30 Nov 2020	Email	[UNCLASSIFIED] RE- [IN-CONFIDENCE] Shared evidence base
128a- j		Attachments	Attachments mentioned in email of 24 Nov 2020 at 4:32 pm – draft chatpers - Draft Advice.
129	30 Nov 2020	Email	2020-11-30-[UNCLASSIFIED] RE- Draft Climate Change Commission Waste chapter for facts and accuracy checking- with attachment - attached.pdf
129a		Attachment	Evidence CH 04d - Waste Reducing emissions SENT FOR PEER REVIEW.docx
130	1 Dec 2020	Email	[UNCLASSIFIED] For peer review- fact checking and accuracy checking of Climate Change Commission Evidence report
130a		Attachment	Evidence Ch04d – Waste reducing emissions SENT FOR PEER REVIEW.docx
131	3 Dec 2020	Email	UNCLASSIFIED]: Fw: To discuss-review of impacts chapter
131a		Attachment	Evidence CH Impacts – for external review.docx
132	4 Dec 2020	Email	2020-12-4-RE_ [UNCLASSIFIED] Draft Climate Change Commission Waste chapter - with attachment.pdf
132a		Attachment	Evidence Ch04d – Waste reducing emissions SENT FOR PEER REVIEW – MfE comments.docx
133	7 Dec 2020	Email	RE: [UNCLASSIFIED] For peer review- fact checking and accuracy checking of Climate Change Commission Evidence report
133a		Attachment	Evidence Ch04d – Waste reducing emissions SENT FOR PEER REVIEW.docx
134			Ch. 02 – What are other countries doing?
135	7 Dec 2020	Email	2020-12-7-RE-[UNCLASSIFIED] Feedback wanted-Waste Sector Report.pdf
Respon	se Bundle 3 – Doc	uments withhel	d in full under 9(2)(g)(i)
136	24 Nov 2020	Email	Evidence CH Sector Focus Removals - Options Challenges MfE VIEW
136a		Attachment	Evidence CH Sector Focus Removals - Options Challenges SENT FOR REVIEW.docx
137	4 Dec 2020	Email	FW_ FEEDBACK DUE 12pm THUR 3 DEC - FW_ [UNCLASSIFIED] RE_ Draft Climate Change Commission Waste chapter for facts and accuracy checking

138	18 Dec 2020	Email	Drivers of long term carbon storage in production forests and the role of HWP.pdf
138a		Attachment	Markdownsummary-of-LTA-model-results.html
139	9 April 2021	Email	[COMMERCIAL]RE: Yield tables and long term average stock estimates
139a		Attachment	Impact of removing harvest residues on the LTA.xlsx
139b		Attachment	Data_from_paul_edited_forestry_to_bioenergy-202012081348-pathway-summary.xlsx
139с		Attachment	The impact of bioenergy removals on carbon storage and substitution effects2.docx
139d		Attachment	Harvest projections from Privacy-MPI Staff.xlsx
140	9 April 2021	Email	FW: Investigation of CCC and MPI forest models
140a		Attachment	Forestry emissions model excerpt from ENZ 2021-03-24.xlsx
141	6 June 2021	Email	Discussion on Agriculture modelling differences
142	10 Feb 2020	Email	RE_ Afforestation on DoC land
143	11 Feb 2020	Email	RE_ Forestry modelling
144	17 Feb 2020	Email	RE_ Question regarding GWP
145	18 Feb 2020	Email	RE_ Forestry modelling
146	19 Feb 2020	Email	RE- Forestry modelling
147	14 April 2020	Email	RE_ Forests_ Herbivores and Carbon Stocks
148	17 April 2020	Email	RE_ Forests_ Herbivores and Carbon Stocks
148a		Attachment	wild-animal-control-emissions-management.pdf
149	20 April 2020	Email	RE_ Forests_ Herbivores and Carbon Stocks
150	20 April 2020	Email	RE_ Forests_ Herbivores and Carbon Stocks-with attachments
150a		Attachment	Reporting and accounting of emissions from land-use and forestry.docx
151	22 May 2020	Email	RE_ long term yield tables for exotics and natives
152	25 May 2020	Email	RE_ long term yield tables for exotics and natives.pdf
153	27 May 2020	Email	RE: [UNCLASSIFIED] Peer review_with attachmentpdf
153a		Attachment	Technical briefing paper - Waste chapter outline and key considerations DRAFT.docx
154	30 June 2020	Email	Reporting and accounting of emissions from land-use and forestry-with attachment
154a		Attachment	Reporting and accounting of emissions from land-use and forestry.docx
155	2 July 2020	Email	2020-7-2-RE: Counting Forests' emissions and removals in budgets and targets-with attachmentpdf
155a		Attachment	non_KP_emissions2.html
156	5 Aug 2020	Email	RE: Spreadsheets underlying the BERG analyses?
157	9 Sept 2020	Email	RE: [UNCLASSIFIED] RE: Notes from the TRG meeting and feedback wanted on scenario assumptions-with attachments
157a		Attachment	Note included, as same as attachment below – see MfE feedback to the TRG on targets proposed by the CCC Aug 2020.pdf
157b		Attachment	MfE feedback to the TRG on targets proposed by the CCC Aug 2020.pdf
158	16 Nov 2020	Email	RE: Proportion of NZ's pine forests that are permanent?

Response Bundle 4 – Documents withheld in full under 9(2)(g)(i)					
173a		Attachment	Analysis of the 2019 NFI dataset.pdf		
173	12 May 2021	Email	RE: [IN-CONFIDENCE]RE: 2021 GHG inventory		
172a		Attachment	non_KP_emissions2.html		
172	11 May 2021	Email	RE: Counting Forests' emissions and removals in budgets and targets - unable to open attachment		
171	19 March 2021	Meeting notes	MeetingwAgencies_AgForestry		
170b		Attachment	Post-1989 natural forest yield table 2020_final.xlsx		
170a		Attachment	Post89 natural forest analysis report.pdf		
170	4 Dec 2020	Email	RE: Wakelin 2020 - quick question		
169a		Attachment	Scion - Reporting NDC under Averaging Accounting for Post89 forests for MPI.pdf		
169	4 Dec 2020	Email	RE: Wakelin 2020 - quick question		
168a		Attachment	Evidence CH Sector Focus Removals - Options Challenges SENT FOR REVIEW.docx		
168	24 Nov 2020	Email	FW: Evidence CH Sector Focus Removals - Options Challenges MfE VIEW - attachment		
167	22 May 2020	Email	Re: long term yield tables for exotics and natives		
166	28 April 2020	Email	RE: Native forests and pests.pdf		
165	24 April 2020	Email	Native forests and pests		
164	18 Feb 2020	Email	RE: Forestry modelling		
163	17 Feb 2020	Email	RE: Forestry modelling		
162b		Attachment	Attachment mentioned in email of 14 April 2020 – Copy of Forestry emissions mode		
162a		Attachment	Attachment mentioned in email of 14 April 2020 – Review of CCC Forestry Projections.docx		
162	15 April 2021	Email	R: Investigation of CCC and MPI forest models		
161a		Attachment	Copy of Bioenergy substitution emissions flux examples.xlsx		
161	9 April 2021	Email	RE: [COMMERCIAL]RE: Yield tables and long term average stock estimates		
160d		Attachment	Html document mentioned in email of 26 March 2021 2:35 pm – Markdown— Summary of LTA model results		
160c		Attachment	2019 NFI Planted Forest Yield Tables.xlsx		
160b		Attachment	Forest-planted report mentioned in email of 26 March 2021 2:35 pm — The 2019  NFI plot analysis Yield tables and carbon stocks at measurement		
160a		Attachment	Spreadsheet mentioned in email of 30 March 2021 at 7:31am –foresty to bioenergy 202102081348 -pathway summary.xlsx		
160	30 March 2021	Email	RE: Yield tables and long term average stock estimates		
159a		Attachment	Evidence CH 04d - Waste Reducing emissions SENT FOR PEER REVIEW - MfE comments.docx		
159	4 Dec 2020	Email	RE: [UNCLASSIFIED] Draft Climate Change Commission Waste chapter for facts and accuracy checking		

174	11 Feb 2020	Email	RE: Question regarding GWP
175	16 April 2020	Email	RE: [UNCLASSIFIED] Timing of ETS unit supply and price setting advice from the Commission
176	20 April 2020	Email	FW: Forests, Herbivores and Carbon Stocks
177	22 June 2020 at 9:54 am	Email	RE: [UNCLASSIFIED] RE: Chat on budgets and accounting?
178	22 June 2020 at 12:26 pm	Email	RE: [UNCLASSIFIED] RE: Chat on budgets and accounting?
179	2 July 2020	Email	Fwd: p89 averaging forest averaging approach
179a		Attachment	Scion - Reporting NDC under Averaging Accounting for Post89 forests for MPI.pdf
180	2 July 2020	Email	RE: Counting forests' emissions and removals in budgets and targets and attachment
180a		Attachment	non_KP_emissions2.html
181	6 July 2020	Email	Reference level discussion – accounting for land use in the net zero target.
181a		Attachment	FINAL FM in 2030 target_MS1 Workshop Report.docx
181b		Attachment	How should LULUCF emissions be accounted for in the 2050 target.docx
182	7 July 2020	Email	RE: Reference level discussion - accounting for land use in the net zero target
183	9 July 2020	Email	RE: [IN CONFIDENCE] Rules for measuring progress].
183a		Attachment	Rules for measuring progress.docx
184	14 July 2020	Email	RE: [UNCLASSIFIED] RE: [IN CONFIDENCE] Rules for measuring progress
185	24 July 2020	Email	ZCB emission reduction framework – working diagrams
185a		Attachment	Working diagrams - ZC emission reduction framework 22-07-2020.pdf
186	4 Aug 2020	Email	RE: NIR reference
187	11 Aug 2020	Email	RE: [UNCLASSIFIED] meeting to talk metrics - AR4 vs AR5
188	19 Aug 2020	Email	RE: [UNCLASSIFIED] diagrams of GHG warming effects?
189	24 Aug 2020	Email	FW: NDC under different GWPs
190	25 Aug 2020	Email	RE: [UNCLASSIFIED] Questions re fossil methane GWP 100 value
191	26 Aug 2020	Email	RE: [UNCLASSIFIED] Fact check re AR5 metrics
192	1 Oct 2020	Email	RE: [UNCLASSIFIED] wording check - Article 6.2 (OK to get back to me on Thurs?)
192a		Attachment	Article 6 TC.docx
193	27 Nov 2020	Email	RE: [UNCLASSIFIED] Can we use this graph in our reports and does it need updating?
193a		Attachment	Rough bullet-point outline mentioned in email of 1 July 2020 at 4:53 pm.
194	4 Dec 2020	Email	RE: [UNCLASSIFIED] RE: Draft CCC rules for measuring progress evidence chapter – for accuracy / fact check
194a		Attachment	Evidence Chapter - Rules for measuring progress - for LUCAS MPI accuracy check_CC.docx
195	7 Dec 2020	Email	RE: [UNCLASSIFIED] RE: Draft CCC rules for measuring progress evidence chapter - for accuracy / fact check
196	23 Feb 2021	Email	RE: [UNCLASSIFIED] RE: Commission budget annual breakdown
196a		Attachment	Results excerpt for MfE - draft annual budget volumes 20210223.xlsx

197	23 Feb 2021	Email	FW: Discussion with MfE on emissions budgets modelling	
198	15 March 2021	Email	RE: [UNCLASSIFIED] effect of draft CCC rec on accounting for voluntary offsetting	
199	6 April 2021	Email	CCC advice response - Rules for Measuring Progress	
199a		Attachment	CCC advice response - Rules for Measuring Progress.docx	
200	26 May 2021	Email	RE: checking some ETS numbers	
201	5 Aug 2020	Email	RE: [UNCLASSIFIED] RE: AR4 vs AR5	
202	5 Feb 2021	Email	RE: NDC	
203	3 Aug 2020	Email	RE: [UNCLASSIFIED] RE: NDC metrics	
204	21 Aug 2020	Email	RE: [UNCLASSIFIED] Approach to the NDC work	
205	2 Sept 2020	Email	RE: [UNCLASSIFIED] Question on natural forest area	
206	24 Aug 2020	Email	FW: NDC under different GWPs	
207	16 Oct 2020	Email	RE: [UNCLASSIFIED] Science piece for peer review	
207a		Attachment	Forster Fuglestvedt Millar NetZero-NZ-report-DRAFT_V1-REVISION_AR.docx	
208	18 Nov 2020	Email	RE: next catch-ups; re NDC advice, and on scenario guidance	
209	25 Nov 2020	Email	RE: next catch-ups; re NDC advice, and on scenario guidance	
210	16 Dec 2020	Email	Converting targets to NDCs	
211	11 Jan 2021	Email	Re: [UNCLASSIFIED] Permission to use a figure of yours?	
Response Bundle 5 – Documents withheld in full under 9(2)(g)(i)				
212	9 Dec 2020	Email	RE: [UNCLASSIFIED] RE: 'Averaging_ chart	
212a		Attachment	Scion - Reporting NDC under Averaging Accounting for Post89 forests for MPI.pdf	
212b		Attachment	LTA graph vs permanent forest.xlsx	
213	30 Nov 2020	Email	[UNCLASSIFIED] Draft Climate Change Commission Waste chapter for facts and accuracy checking	
214		Attachment	Evidence CH 04d - Waste Reducing emissions SENT FOR PEER REVIEW.docx	