

Ref: OIA 2023-005

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

31 March 2023

Tēnā koe [REDACTED]
scope

Thank you for your email of 2 February 2023 requesting information under the Official Information Act 1982 (the Act).

On 22 February 2023, the wording of your request was refined as follows:

Any meeting minutes, papers, advice or correspondence (but excluding administrative correspondence and correspondence related to the public consultation process for Ināia tonu nei) sent to/created by the CCC from February 2021 to December 2021 about reducing stocking rates on dairy farms. This may also be referred to as “reducing intensity”, “reducing herd size” and “reducing livestock numbers” etc.

Any minutes, papers, advice or correspondence (but excluding administrative correspondence and correspondence related to the public consultation process for Ināia tonu nei) from February 2021 to December 2021 about changing land use from dairy/sheep/beef to other uses such as horticulture or cropping

Any minutes, papers, advice or correspondence (but excluding administrative correspondence and correspondence related to the public consultation process for Ināia tonu nei) from February 2021 to December 2021 about plant-based meat substitutes

On 3 March 2023, we advised you of a 20 working days extension to the timeframe to respond to this request. This extension was made under Sections 15A(1)(a) and (b) of the Act as your original request was for a large quantity of information or required us to search through a large quantity of information, and consultations necessary to make a decision on the request could not reasonably be made within the original time limit.

Our response

Following the refinement of your request, we were able to narrow our search parameters and found 12 documents containing information to be within the scope of your request.

Please note we generally consult on a number of topics at once as our advice covers the sector broadly. This means that as your request covers subject areas that are closely related to our advice on agriculture, particularly where you have requested information about changes to stocking rates and land use, the

documents we are releasing to you do contain some information outside the scope of your request that we have not included in our response. Where this is the case it is detailed in the document schedule, along with the other decisions taken when we considered your request.

#	Type	Date	Title	Decision
1	Emails	1 Feb 2021	<i>Fewer cows recommendation absolute nonsense</i>	Some information has been withheld under Section 9(2)(a) of the Act to protect the privacy of individuals. Information that is deemed outside the scope of your request has not been included.
2	Article attachment to an email	2 Feb 2021	<i>Climate report sets up fight over herd sizes</i>	The article attachment is publicly available at: https://www.newsroom.co.nz/climate-report-sets-up-fight-over-herd-sizes#:~:text=The%20Climate%20Change%20Commission%20proved,agricultural%20sector%3A%20Have%20fewer%20cows. Information that is deemed outside the scope of your request has not been included (i.e., the administrative emails the article was originally attached to).
3	Emails	3 Feb 2021	<i>Points on stock numbers</i>	Some information has been withheld under Section 9(2)(a) of the Act to protect the privacy of individuals. Information that is deemed outside the scope of your request has not been included.
4	Draft report	21 Feb 2021	<i>Data Sources for All CCC Models</i>	Information that is deemed outside the scope of your request has not been included.
5	Letter	21 Jul-10 Aug 2021	<i>Letter from member of the public</i>	Some information has been withheld under Section 9(2)(a) of the Act to protect the privacy of individuals. Information that is deemed outside the scope of your request has not been included.
6	Report	23 Sep 2021	<i>Synthetic N report</i>	This report is publicly available on our website: https://www.climatecommission.govt.nz/public/Further-analysis-on-synthetic-nitrogen.pdf You may find pages 1, 2 and 4 to be of most use.
7	Draft report	Oct 2021	<i>Land Use, Balance of Payments and Emissions</i>	Information that is deemed outside the scope of your request has not been included.

				This document also contained comments that were editing suggestions and administrative in nature and thus were removed as they were outside of the scope of your request.
8	Draft report	22 Oct 2021	<i>NDC and further domestic action board feedback</i>	Information that is deemed outside the scope of your request has not been included.
9	Draft report	26 Oct 2021	<i>Pricing agricultural GHG emissions: sectoral impacts and cost benefit analysis</i>	This report is publicly available at: https://hewakaekenoa.nz/wp-content/uploads/2022/06/FINAL-Pricing-agricultural-GHG-emissions-sectoral-impacts-and-cost-benefit-analysis.pdf
10	Draft report		<i>Scenario Assumption Log (Ag + Land Use) updated</i>	Information that is deemed outside the scope of your request has not been included.
11	Infographic	Dec 2021	<i>Assessing proposals for mechanisms to price farm-level emissions</i>	Information that is deemed outside the scope of your request has not been included. To note: These documents are excerpts from stakeholder workshops we conducted for the <i>Agricultural Progress Assessment</i> report. We used a virtual whiteboard to facilitate the discussion and have redacted comments not pertaining to your request. The final notes from our workshops are available on our website: https://www.climatecommission.govt.nz/public/Advice-on-Agricultural-Assistance/FINAL-REPORT-Notes-from-CCC-Stakeholder-Workshops_Redacted.pdf
12	Infographic	Dec 2021	<i>Advice on Agricultural Assistance</i>	Information that is deemed outside the scope of your request has not been included.

In all of the Commission's consultation and engagement, we meet with a wide range of people. It is important to note that the Commission does not accept speaker fees, travel costs, or payment of any kind when undertaking consultation and engagement. We assess requests we receive for meetings on their merit and on staff capacity, and engagement develops our thinking to seek insights and evidence to help test our analysis.

You may also be interested in reading the following advice on agriculture, which is publicly available on our website:

- *Ināia tonu nei*: <https://www.climatecommission.govt.nz/public/Inaia-tonu-nei-a-low-emissions-future-for-Aotearoa/Inaia-tonu-nei-a-low-emissions-future-for-Aotearoa.pdf>
- *Agricultural Progress Assessment*: <https://www.climatecommission.govt.nz/public/Advice-on-Agricultural-Assistance/Progress-towards-agricultural-emissions-pricing-CCC-report.pdf>

- *Agricultural Assistance Report*: https://www.climatecommission.govt.nz/public/Advice-on-Agricultural-Assistance/CCC-4441-Agricultural-Assistance-Report_a4-WEB.pdf

Our next piece of advice, on the direction for the second emissions reduction plan, will be released for consultation in April 2023.

Understanding how the sector will be impacted, and how to manage the transition equitably is central to our advice. However, we do not design or implement the detailed policies and systems that will drive some of these changes.

For further information on the subject areas of your request, I recommend looking at some of the work done by Government in designing these policies. Namely, the recently proposed agricultural emissions pricing system, which is likely to influence land use change and stocking rates to some degree, available at: <https://environment.govt.nz/assets/publications/Pricing-agricultural-emissions-report-under-section-215-of-the-CCRA.pdf>

In designing their proposal for a pricing system, He Waka Eke Noa commissioned modelling on the sectoral impacts of an emission pricing system. The draft for this proposal is provided to you in Document 9. The final version included modelling land use change and stocking rates under different scenarios and is available at: <https://hewakaekenoa.nz/wp-content/uploads/2022/06/FINAL-Pricing-agricultural-GHG-emissions-sectoral-impacts-and-cost-benefit-analysis.pdf>

He Waka Eke Noa also performed a number of farm case studies and provided financial analysis of the impacts of emissions pricing on different farm systems. Please note that these reports were prepared before the final proposal for the pricing system was in place, so some details may differ: <https://hewakaekenoa.nz/wp-content/uploads/2022/06/FINAL-Farm-case-studies-report.pdf>

You have the right to seek an investigation and review of this response by the Office of the Ombudsman, in accordance with section 28(3) of the Act. The relevant details can be found on their website at: www.ombudsman.parliament.nz

The Commission has a policy of proactive release of responses to requests made under the Act to help others have access to more information. As a result, this letter will shortly be published on the website with your name and contact details redacted to protect your privacy.

Ngā mihi



Stephen Walter
General Manager – Emissions Budgets, Adaptation & Markets
Climate Change Commission